#### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

	)	
PHYLLIS H. KISER,	)	<b>Consolidated Under</b>
,	)	MDL 875
Plaintiff,	)	
	)	Civil Action
	)	No. 2:11cv60039
<b>v.</b>	)	
	)	Transferred from the Western
	)	District of Virginia
A.W. CHESTERTON CO., ET AL.,	)	
	)	
Defendants.	)	
	)	

#### **ORDER**

Pursuant to Rule 5:40 of the Rules of the Supreme Court of Virginia, the following question of law is hereby certified to the Supreme Court of Virginia:

#### (1) Nature of the controversy in which the question arises

This is an asbestos personal injury case arising under Virginia law that is pending in federal court based on diversity of citizenship. The plaintiff's decedent, Orvin Kiser, Sr., was diagnosed with an asbestos-related non-malignant disease in 1988 (non-malignant pleural thickening and asbestosis) and was diagnosed with mesothelioma on November 9, 2009.

#### (2) Question of law to be answered

The question of law certified is whether the statute of limitations began to run on the claim for mesothelioma when Mr. Kiser was diagnosed with a non-malignant disease in 1988 or instead first began to run on November 2009, when he was first diagnosed with mesothelioma.

#### (3) All facts relevant to the questioned certified

Plaintiff's decedent, Orvin Kiser, Sr., was diagnosed with an asbestos-related non-malignant disease in 1988 (non-malignant pleural thickening and asbestosis) and was later diagnosed with mesothelioma on November 9, 2009. Mesothelioma is a separate and distinct injury from non-malignant pleural thickening and asbestosis. The latter cannot be said to "cause" the former and, indeed, the two have separate and distinct disease processes. Additionally, while pleural thickening and asbestosis are dose-related illnesses, mesothelioma is not dependent upon the quantum of exposure to asbestos.

#### (4) Names of each of the parties involved

Phyllis H. Kiser, Executrix of the Estate of Orvin H. Kiser, Sr., Deceased

A.W. Chesterton Company

**Crane Packing Company** 

Crown Cork & Seal Company, Inc.

**Exxon Mobil Corporation** 

Foster Wheeler Corporation

General Electric Company

General Refractories Company

Georgia-Pacific Corporation

Goulds Pumps, Inc.

Harsco Industrial Patterson-Kelley

**Ingersoll-Rand Company** 

John Crane, Inc.

Metropolitan Life Insurance Company

Rapid American Corporation

Riley Power, Inc.

SEPCO. Inc.

Trane U.S., Inc.

Uniroyal, Inc.

**CBS** Corporation

Warren Pumps, LLC

Zenith Pumps

### (5) Names, Virginia State Bar number, mailing address, telephone number (including any applicable extension), facsimile number (if any), and email address (if any) of counsel for each of the parties involved

R. Thomas Radcliffe, Jr., Esq. (VSB No. 34711)

Kay Millicent Brown, Esq. (VSB No. 30764)

Kira A. Ligato, Esq. (VSB No. 51055)

DeHay & Elliston, LLP

36 S. Charles Street, Suite 1300

Baltimore, MD 21201

Phone: 410-783-7225

Fax: 410-783-7221

Goulds Pumps, Inc.

rtr@dehay.com

kbrown@dehay.com kligato@dehay.com

Jeffrey Poretz, Esq. (VSB No. 27399)

Carl R. Schwertz, Esq. (VSB No. 38529)

Miles & Stockbridge, PC

1751 Pinnacle Drive, Suite 500

McLean, VA 22102-3833

Phone: 703-903-9000

Fax: 703-610-8686

**Georgia Pacific Corporation** 

jporetz@milestockbridge.com

cschwertz@milesstockbridge.com

Richard. W. Boone, Sr., Esq.(DC Bar No. 50906) Albert H. Poole, Esq. (VSB No. 19709) Boone & Associates, PC Huff, Poole & Mahoney, P.C. 10195 Main Street, Suite D 4705 Columbus Street Fairfax, VA 22031-3415 Virginia Beach, VA 23462 Phone: 703-934-2780 Phone: 757-499-1841 Fax: 703-934-2785 Fax: 757-552-6016 Crown Cork & Seal Co., Inc. Trane US Inc. rwboone@aol.com apoole@hpmlaw.com Anthony B. Taddeo, Jr., Esq. (VSB No. 70677) Patricia Bugg Turner, Esq. (VSB No. 72775) Matthew D. Joss, Esq. (VSB No. 48434) M. F. Connell Mullins, Jr., Esq. (VSB No. 47213) David M. Sturm, Esq. (VSB No. 44580) Henry N. Ware, Jr., Esq. (VSB No. 22832) Taddeo & Sturm, PLC Spotts Fain, PC 3 West Cary Street 411 East Franklin Street, Suite 600 Richmond, VA 23220 P.O. Box 1555 Phone: 804-344-8540 Richmond, VA 23218-1555 Fax: 804-344-8541 Phone: 804-697-2000 **Foster Wheeler Corporation** Fax: 804-697-2100 **General Electric Company Ingersoll-Rand Company** taddeo@taddeosturm.com **CBS** Corporation joss@taddeosturm.com pturner@spottsfain.com sturm@taddeosturm.com cmullins@spottsfain.com hnware@spottsfain.com Martin A. Conn, Esq. (VSB No. 39113) Bruce T. Bishop, Esq. (VSB No. 16029) Eric G. Reeves, Esq. (VSB No. 38149) Stephen R. Jackson, Esq. (VSB No. 27471) Brian J. Schneider, Esq. (VSB No. 45841) Joyce Jackson Wood, Esq. (VSB No. 19969) C. Stinson Munday, Esq. (VSB No. 71214) Willcox & Savage, PC 440 Monticello Avenue, Suite 2200 Moran Reeves & Conn PC 4110 E. Parham Road Norfolk, VA 23510-2243 Phone: 757-628-5500 Richmond, VA 23228 Phone: 804-421-6250 Fax: 757-628-5566

**Exxon Mobil Corporation** 

Riley Power, Inc.

bbishop@wilsav.com

sjackson@wilsav.com jwood@wilsav.com

SEPCO. Inc.

**Rapid-American Corporation** 

Fax: 804-421-6251

John Crane, Inc.

A.W. Chesterton Company

**Crane Packing Company** 

<u>bschneider@mrcpclaw.com</u> smundy@mrcpclaw.com

mconn@mrcpclaw.com ereeves@mrcpclaw.com

C 66 C C E ./E 1 1D N 01007)	II DE'I 'I I E (VODN 22207)	
Geoffrey S. Gavett, Esq. (Federal Bar No. 01997)	John P. Fishwick, Jr., Esq. (VSB No. 23285)	
Katherine S. Duyer, Esq. (Federal Bar No. 03045)	LichtensteinFishwick, PLC	
Gavett & Datt, PC	Liberty Trust Building, Suite 400	
15850 Crabbs Branch Way, Suite 180	101 South Jefferson Street	
Rockville, MD 20855-2622	Roanoke, VA 24011	
Phone: 301-948-1177	Phone: 540-343-9711	
Fax: 301-948-4334	Fax: 540-343-9713	
Harsco Industrial Patterson-Kelley	<b>Metropolitan Life Insurance Company</b>	
ggavett@gavettdatt.com	jpf@vatrials.com	
kduyer@gavettdatt.com		
Timothy S. Brunick, Esq. (VSB No. 35783)	Joshua D. Scheets, Esq.	
Clarke, Dolph, Rapaport, Hull, Brunick &	(Attorney ID No. 203015)	
Garriott, PLC	Marshall, Dennehey, Warner, Coleman & Goggin	
6160 Kempsville Circle, Suite 101A	1845 Walnut Street, 13 <sup>th</sup> Floor	
Norfolk, VA 23502	Philadelphia, PA 19103	
Phone: 757-466-0464	Phone: 215-575-2600	
Fax: 757-466-0834	Fax: 215-575-0856	
Warren Pumps, LLC	Zenith Pumps	
tbrunick@clarkedolph.com	jdscheets@mdwcg.com	
Nathan D. Finch, Esquire (VSB No. 34290)	Gary W. Kendall, Esq. (VSB No. 15651)	
Motley Rice, LLC	J. Gregory Webb, Esq. (VSB No. 38157)	
1000 Potomac Street, NW, Suite 150	E. Kyle McNew, Esq. (VSB No. 73210)	
Washington, DC 20007	Michie Hamlett Lowry Rasmussen & Tweel	
Phone: 202-232-5507	PLLC	
Fax: 202-232-5531 Fax	500 Court Square, Suite 300	
Plaintiff	P.O. Box 298	
nfinch@motleyrice.com	Charlottesville, VA 22902-0298	
	Phone: 434-951-7200	
	Fax: 434-951-7218	
	Plaintiff	
	gkendall@michiehamlett.com	
	gwebb@michiehamlett.com	
	kmcnew@michiehamlett.com	

# (6) Brief statement explaining how the certified question of law is determinative of the proceeding in the certifying court

If the statute of limitations on the plaintiff's decedent's claim for mesothelioma began to run in November of 2009 when he was diagnosed with mesothelioma, his claim was timely and the cause continues. However, if the statute of limitations began to run on the plaintiff's decedent's claim for mesothelioma when he was first diagnosed with an asbestos-related non-malignant disease or condition in 1988, the case is barred by Virginia's two year statute of limitations.

## (7) Brief statement of relevant decisions, if any, of the Supreme Court of Virginia and the Court of Appeals of Virginia and the reasons why such decisions are not controlling

Locke v. Johns Manville Corp., 275 S.E.2d 900 (Va. 1981). This case is relevant but not controlling. First, it did not involve a plaintiff with a second or subsequent asbestos-related disease. Second, it was decided before the Virginia General Assembly amended the statute of limitations applicable to asbestos personal injury claims in 1985. See Virginia Code Va. Code Ann. § 8.01-249(4) ("The cause of action in the actions herein listed shall be deemed to accrue as follows: . . . . 4. In actions for injury to the person resulting from exposure to asbestos or products containing asbestos, when a diagnosis of asbestosis, interstitial fibrosis, mesothelioma, or other disabling asbestos-related injury or disease is first communicated to the person or his agent by a physician.").

The Clerk shall take all steps necessary to transmit this Order to the Supreme Court of Virginia in compliance with Rule 5:40 of the Rules of that Court.

AND IT IS SO ORDERED.

Eduardo C. Robreno
United States District Judge

Entered this \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2011 Philadelphia, Pennsylvania